

THE ECONOMIC REALITY OF SALVAGE LOGGING

They Predicted Job Creation...

When he was promoting the passage of the salvage logging rider last summer, Congressman Taylor (R-NC) claimed that the rider would “create approximately 22,900 direct and indirect forest product industry jobs.”

...But What REALLY Happened?

An analysis of total timber industry jobs in the major salvage logging states (OR, WA, ID, MT, and CA, which provided 87% of the salvage receipts for 1992 - 1994) showed no increase in jobs since the 1995 passage of the salvage rider. By Congressman Taylor’s account, these states should have had an extra 20,000 jobs. But they show little net change.

They Predicted Increased Revenue...

Taylor expected the new jobs would generate an extra \$150,000,000 to the Treasury in the form of federal taxes paid by new workers.

... But What REALLY Happened?

With no change in the total number of workers, an increased tax revenue to the Federal Treasury will not occur.

You Pay Not Once but THREE TIMES, as a Result of Salvage Logging

- 1) You pay for the trees to be cut
- 2) You pay for the trees to be replanted
- 3) You and future generations pay for ecological damage and the other hidden costs

① You Pay for the Cutting

Salvage Sales Add to the National Debt

• The General Accounting Office report on the Forest Service timber program for 1992-1994, which groups together green and salvage sales, states that 18 billion board feet (BBF)* were cut from 2.2 million National Forest acres and actually increased the national debt by \$1 billion!

***see last page of this fact sheet:”How to visualize board feet”**

• 103 out of the 118 sales that were classified as salvage/green lost money, including all of the sales that occurred in Idaho and Montana. It cost you, the taxpayer, an average of \$450/acre to log the public lands.

Revenue from Salvage Logging Will NOT Go to the U.S. Treasury

• As reported by the Congressional Research Service (CRS), “the Forest Service has never transferred any excess salvage sale revenues to the U.S. Treasury.” Rather, any profits are added to the Timber Salvage Sale Fund. This Fund’s money is used to perpetuate and/or expand salvage logging efforts. But total costs of salvage logging are not covered by the Fund, and require further appropriations.

• The net effect of extra logging under the Emergency Salvage Logging Program is a cost to the Federal Treasury of over \$50 million.

Hidden Costs of Roadbuilding and “Research”

• The Forest Service’s distorted bookkeeping calls road construction income. A road is considered an asset, although roads require maintenance, which is an expense, and roads cause damage to fisheries and other resources during their construction that often contribute to erosion and flooding. When road construction is viewed this way, the salvage timber sales look more profitable, when, in fact, federal taxpayers pay the price for new road construction.

• The Forest Service appropriated \$178 million in 1996 and almost \$200 million in 1995 for research primarily for commercial applications. An example is the total national inventory that occurs every ten years classifying all sellable timber by ownership, class and size. This information is free to the timber companies. Commercial research should be terminated or only conducted if the full costs of the research are paid by its commercial benefactors.

② You Pay for Replanting

Regeneration Costs

- Forest Service costs for planting and seeding on cut acres as a part of tree regeneration for the years 1977-1994 totaled \$2,449,900,000.

- This figure does not show that only 49% of the planted acres received satisfactory regeneration certification. When a plantation fails, it is re-entered as a new planting. The cost works out to \$314 per acre planted. Considering that 51% fail, this is a waste of about one and a quarter billion taxpayer dollars.

③ You Pay for Ecological Damage and Other Hidden Costs

Why are the Public Land Timber Sales so Frequently “Below Cost?”

Most taxpayers are unaware that salvage logging, in addition to degrading our public lands under the banner of “health crisis,” is also a drain on everyone’s wallet. Taxpayers are subsidizing logging on federal land because timber companies are not responsible for any indirect (hidden) costs associated with their cutting, so the onus rests on the national and local public to pay. Some of the reasons costs are overlooked include:

- The amount that timber companies pay for the logs they remove from federal lands is often less than the costs federal agencies incur to sell the timber (preparing and administering the sale).
- Logging will cause an increase in the level of sediment in streams and rivers. Taxpayers will pay the costs of dredging waterways, repairing roads and removing sediment from water supplies. For example, it cost about \$1 million to clean up more than 500,000 tons of debris and repair the road associated with the slide of Quartz Creek on the Clearwater National Forest, where heavy logging took place. This is just one storm in one area; it will cost taxpayers more than \$8 million to repair damaged forest logging roads in Northern Idaho and Western Montana.
- Taxpayers will pay to cope with damage to ecosystems caused by destructive logging and roadbuilding practices. Some effects frequently associated with logging and roadbuilding include fragmentation of the habitat of wide-ranging species such as the grizzly bear, degradation of critical habitat for rare and sensitive species, a lowering of water and soil quality, and a general decrease in biodiversity.
- Property owners will have to pay whenever logging on federal lands causes them to incur extra risk of flood damage on private property adjacent to logging areas. Flood damage is often greater during storms and snow melts in logged areas.
- Based on a Department of Agriculture study of the costs of off-site damage of sediment, the value of the damages associated with cutting 4.5 BBF will total about \$58.5 million.
- The commercial and recreational fishing industry will suffer reduced income as logging degrades essential salmon habitat and lowers viable salmon populations.
- Businesses downstream of timber extraction will incur extra costs due to the sedimentation of water they use in various processes.
- Business owners and workers will suffer. They will have to pay extra unemployment insurance costs because the timber industry does not cover all of its costs. Based on Idaho timber company data, a 4.5 BBF harvest (the total anticipated harvest under the Emergency Salvage Logging Program) would impose an estimated \$13.5 million on other industries.
- Non-commercial values, such as recreation, aesthetic, ecological functions and spiritual values, will be compromised by the destruction linked to logging practices. These values cannot be converted to dollar figures, and so are ignored in the Forest Service’s cost/benefit analyses.

Sources

- Department of Agriculture's Report to the Congress regarding Implementation of Section 2001 of the Fiscal Year 1995 Rescissions Act.
- Department of Agriculture's study on off-site damage of sediment from highly erodible farmland in the Pacific states
- General Accounting Office, *Report on the Forest Service Timber Program, 1992-1994*.
- Gorte, R.W., Congressional Research Service, *Federal Financial Consequences of the Emergency Salvage Timber Sale Program*, February 7, 1996.
- Gullo, T., Congressional Budget Office, Washington, D.C., communication on March 21, 1995.
- Niemi, E. and Whitelaw, E., *The Full Economic Costs of Proposed Salvage Logging on Federal Lands, Preliminary Report*, March 1995.
- Production, Prices, Employment and Trade, 2nd quarter, 1995*.
- Congressman Taylor, article in Journal of Forestry, July 1995.
- Wolf, R.E., former Assistant Chief, Environment and Natural Resources Division, Congressional Research Service, analysis provided to the Alliance for the Wild Rockies. This analysis was peer reviewed by Michael T. Garrity, a University of Utah Ph.D. candidate in economics.

FOR YOUR INFORMATION: HOW TO VISUALIZE BOARD FEET

MBF = thousand board feet

MMBF = million board feet

BBF = billion board feet

For example, 5 MBF would read as "five thousand board feet"

- It takes about 11 MBF to build an average two bedroom house. One logging truck carries 4- 5 MBF per load.
- The total salvage harvested in the Northern Rockies region, for the first half of the fiscal year 1995, was 230.5 MMBF. This is equivalent to about 46,000 logging trucks.
- The total salvage available for future harvest in the Northern Rockies equals 1184.3 MMBF. This is equivalent to about 237,000 logging trucks.
- The total anticipated national salvage under the Emergency Salvage Logging Program is 4.5 BBF. This is equivalent to 900,000 logging trucks.

Protecting Your Public Lands: the Truth about Salvage Logging and “Forest Health”

The intent of this packet is to provide information to concerned citizens, the media, and decision-makers regarding threats to the public lands of the Northern Rockies.

Threats include land management activities that

- Undermine the public participation process
- Degrade water quality
- Push threatened, endangered, or sensitive wildlife and fish populations closer to extinction
- Subsidize corporate timber industries at the expense of the taxpayer
- Sacrifice our national heritage
- Further reduce the number of roadless areas in the Northern Rockies

This information packet provides evidence that in the name of “Forest Health” and Salvage Logging the ecologic and economic integrity of your public lands are being sacrificed and your right to do anything has been revoked.

This packet include specific information regarding the ecological, economic, and social implications of the “forest health” myth and the salvage logging rider signed into law last July by President Clinton.

Background

Timber corporations and the Forest Service often say that the massive clearcuts, degradation of water quality, and destruction of critical wildlife habitat are mistakes of the past. That ecosystem management and ecological forestry are here to stay and that you the public should leave the management of the public lands to them.

The reality is that time and again the Forest Service has failed to protect the public lands and as a direct response to these failures Congress, at the request of the American people enacted environmental laws to curb the industries' unmitigated greed and the destruction of our public lands.

Environmental laws were enacted as a result of hard fought battles involving concerned citizens, grass roots activists, and the so-called special interest groups who were tired of the environmental destruction wrought by the timber industry. It took over 20 years to implement environmental safeguards such as the Clean Water Act, Clean Air Act, the National Environmental Policy Act, and the Endangered Species Act.

Environmental laws were never intended to halt all logging on the public lands, they never have and they never will. Their intent was to ensure that other values such as clean air, water, soil productivity and wildlife populations were adequately protected. The administrative appeals process, too, was an important way for the public to influence land management decisions, to watchdog the Forest Service and ensure that public lands were not abused.

20 years of environmental laws and a meaningful public participation process were destroyed last July in a single pen stroke when President Clinton signed the recissions bill and approved the salvage rider.

The salvage rider allows the US Forest Service and the BLM to proceed with sales without adherence to environmental laws and without a requirement that the sales make money. Bob Wolf, former Senior budget analyst for the Congressional Research Service, estimates it will cost taxpayers somewhere between 430 million and 1.6 billion dollars.

The salvage rider is neither ecologically defensible nor fiscally responsible.

The results of the rider are already becoming clear.....

LAWLESS LOGGING IN THE NORTHERN ROCKIES

The following fact sheet covers the Beaverhead-Deerlodge, Bitterroot, Boise, Bridger-Teton, Caribou, Clearwater, Flathead, Gallatin, Helena, Idaho Panhandle, Kootenai, Lewis and Clark, Lolo, Nez Perce, Payette, Salmon and Challis, Shoshone, and Targhee National Forests, as well as lands administered by the Bureau of Land Management in the Northern Rockies Ecosystem. Last updated on 5/6/96. This sheet applies to all salvage sales currently being prepared and/or sold.

Total Number of Sales.....	318
Total Volume (MMBF).....	538.673
# of Times a Wooden Band, 1ft. Wide, Would Circle the Earth at the Equator.....	4.1
# of Logging Trucks (Ave. Carrying Capacity is 400 MBF)*.....	26,933,675
Total miles of Road Construction.....	476.006
New Roads.....	100.69
Reconstructed Roads.....	352.372
Temporary Roads.....	22.944
# of Roadless and Special Designation Areas to be Logged.....	34
Sales Containing a Substantial Green Component.....	90
Sales Containing Old Growth.....	25
# of Sales Containing Threatened, Endangered, or Sensitive Species Habitat.....	47
Number of Sales in Grizzly Bear Habitat.....	23
in Gray Wolf Habitat.....	19
in Bald Eagle Habitat.....	14
Other Threatened, Endangered and Sensitive Species: Black-backed Woodpecker, Pileated Woodpecker, Boreal Owl, Goshawk, Wolverine, Fisher, Lynx, Northern Bog Lemming, Townsend's Big-Eared Bat, Western Big-Eared Bat, Coeur d'Alene Salamander, Harlequin Duck, Bull Trout, West Slope Cutthroat, White Sturgeon, Sockeye Salmon, Chinook Salmon.	
Number Of Sales Proposed Due To:	
Fire.....	40
Windthrow.....	54
Disease.....	58
Insect Infestation.....	67
For the Prevention of Any of the Above.....	68
No Reason Given.....	31

*Estimate provided by the U.S.D.A. Forest Service, Region One Office, Missoula, MT

**FOR YOUR INFORMATION
HOW TO VISUALIZE BOARD FEET**

MBF = thousand board feet

MMBF = million board feet

BBF = billion board feet

For example, 5 MBF would read as, “ five thousand board feet”

- It takes about 11 MBF to build an average two bedroom house. One logging truck carries 4- 5 MBF per load.
- The total salvage harvested in the Northern Rockies region, for the first half of the fiscal year 1995, was 230.5 MMBF. This is equivalent to about 46,000 logging trucks.
- The total salvage available for future harvest in the Northern Rockies equals 1184.3 MMBF. This is equivalent to about 237,000 logging trucks.
- The total anticipated national salvage under the Emergency Salvage Logging Program is 4.5 BBF. This is equivalent to 900,000 logging trucks.

**THE CLINTON ADMINISTRATION'S AND FOREST SERVICE'S
TOP TEN REASONS
FOR SALVAGE LOGGING***

10. “Fire Proof Stands of Old Growth”
9. “Winter Injury”
8. “Defective Timber”
7. “Poor Vigor”
6. “Old Age”
5. “To Salvage Timber Burned By The Forest Service”
4. “Overstocked and Dense Timber Stands”
3. None Given
2. “Realize Forest Productivity”
1. Two Words -- “Corporate Welfare”

*With the exception of the number one reason, all of these reasons appeared in the “Purpose and Need” section of Salvage Sale Scoping Notices and Environmental Assessments prepared by the Forest Service.

CODE OF FOREST ETHICS

Ever-increasing numbers of groups, businesses and individuals are subscribing to a new “Code of Forest Ethics” which makes the restoration of damaged watersheds and forest ecosystems via road obliteration a top priority. The Code flatly rejects the “forest health” sham being perpetuated by the Forest Service and timber industry, and rejects their “logging is the best medicine” cure.

“A thing is right when it tends to preserve the integrity, stability, and beauty of the biotic community. It is wrong when it tends otherwise.”

- Aldo Leopold

We find that:

The greatest threats to forest ecosystems are too many roads, clearcuts and damaged watersheds, not too many trees. These problems are a result of logging and road building, not the suppression of wildfire.

We subscribe to these principles:

All remaining roadless and unlogged areas must be preserved. The continued march into increasingly scarce native forest does not promote sustainability.

Watersheds which are below standards for water quality, fisheries, wildlife habitat and wildlife security must be brought up to all standards before further timber sales are contemplated.

Road obliteration and reclamation are the primary and most cost-effective ways to accomplish watershed recovery, protect fish and wildlife habitat and reestablish wildlife security.

Ecosystem restoration is a goal and process worthy of public investment. It also provides meaningful, well-paying jobs.

Timber sales neither provide reliable funds for restoration work, nor duplicate the natural role of wildfire. They shall not be promoted for such purposes.

Forest stewardship must be viewed and practiced as more than a kinder and gentler form of tree farming. In already damaged areas, it must begin with ecosystem restoration. It must also recognize the essential role that dead trees play in the forest ecosystem.

Written By Keith Hammer redraven@netrix.net For more info call: 406-755-1369. You are invited to subscribe to the new Code of Forest Ethics. Use it and the league of other subscribers to bolster your position. Anyone willing to honor the Code in their actions is encouraged to subscribe at no cost by contacting Montana Ecosystems Defense Council (MEDC) at Box 1901 Kalispell, MT 59901, 406-755-1379, or redraven@netrix.net.

List of Subscribers to the Code of Forest Ethics

Alliance for the Wild Rockies
Big Wild Advocates
Cascadia Forest Defenders
Citizen Action Center
Citizens Against Lawless Logging
Inland Empire Public Lands Council
Montana Ecosystems Defense Council
Montana Waterwatch
Native Ecosystems Council
Native Forest Network
ROAD-RIP
Sandpoint Forest Watch
Selkirk-Priest Basin Association
Swan View Coalition
The Ecology Center, Inc.
The Ruckus Society
Wild Rockies Info Net
Aurora, Willow. Arbor Vitae
Beaver, Greg. student at Rice University
Bert, Kraft.
Borella, Silvio. Klima-und Umweltphysik, U. of Bern
Brandborg, Stewart.
Campbell, Larry.
Chipping, David. California Polytechnic State University
Coampton, Susan.
Coefield, Jim. Wild Rockies Slate
Coleman, Tim.
Coop, Jonathan.
Craighead, John W.
Eatherington, Francis.
Ferenstein, Jennifer.
Friedman, Mitch. NW Ecosystem Alliance
Funsch, Dan.
Garrity, Michael. Economist
Geist, Darrell. Cold Mountain, Cold Rivers
Gregerson, Susan. Arbor Vitae Organics
Gregory, Alan. The Friends of the Nescopeck
Guild, Tatsy.
Hammer, Keith . Swan View Coalition and MEDC
Hoehn, Laura.
Hogg, Jeff. University of Oregon Survival Center
Horejsi, Brian.
Hourdequin, Marion.
Jensen, Derrick. Author
Johnson, Pierre.
Johnson, Myia. San Leandro High School
Johnston, Jim . Payette Forest Watch, Inc.
Juel, Jeff.
Kelly, Steve.
Lacey, Phillamaum. UO Survival Center
Laughlin, Donnie.
Montgomery, Arlene. Friends of the Wild Swan
Olsen, Marilyn.
Olsen, James.
Olsen, Lance. Olsen's Publishing Company
Sedler, Liz .
Snider, Will. University of Health Sciences
Tiefenbacher, John. Dept. of Geography, SW Texas State U.
Togni, Kathy.
Valentino, Adele.
Wilson, Peter. Global Ocean Consultants, Inc.
Wolke, Howie.

ECOLOGICAL FACTSHEET

No direct, scientific evidence or clear loss figures have been presented by the managing agencies to convincingly indicate a health emergency in our northwestern forests—Dr. Arthur Partridge, Professor, Forest Disease and Insect Problems

Lost in the “forest health” debate is the simple fact that forest ecosystems are dependent on dead and dying trees to sustain wildlife, fish, productive soils, and clean water. Remember, timber harvesting, roadbuilding, and fire suppression have degraded and fragmented forest ecosystems. Here is some information on the ecological significance of dead and dying trees and the scientific misinformation perpetuated by the Forest Service and the timber industry.

How the bureaucrats and scientists differ...

When Measuring Volumes of Sediment

Scientific Method

Measures the actual volume of sediment at specific sites (2).

Forest Service Method

Use aerial photographs to make vague estimates about the volume of sediment generated (2).

When Contemplating Disease

Scientific Method

Recognizes the cyclic nature of diseases (2).

Forest Service Method

Recognizes each outbreak of a disease as a doomsday event (2).

Incorporates proper diagnoses of disease outbreaks (2).

Lumps all diseases together for administrative purposes (2).

Notices that the loss of individual trees is offset by the ecological benefits that the trees provide as they decay (2).

Focuses on the potential economic loss of decaying trees (8).

Observes that not all “at risk” trees die of disease—many reach old age (2).

Puts trees that are “imminently susceptible” to insects and disease up for sale (4).

Scientific Method

Cautiously recognizes that "further disturbance in the form of "salvage" or other heavy activity is going to stress the remaining trees, further modify soil structure, remove wildlife habitats, add to water-quality problems and reverse recovery trends" (2).

Draws conclusions about disease from inventories of diseases (2).

Uses entomologists and pathologists to diagnose disease and identify insects.

Forest Service Method

Proceeds in hasty ignorance and cause soils to deteriorate, water quality to worsen, fisheries to vanish, reduction of wildlife populations, reduce recreational opportunities, and opportunities for sustainable logging to evaporate (2).

Draws conclusions about disease from available timber inventories and estimates disease activity from aerial photos (2).

Uses seasonal employees with a few day's training to diagnose disease and identify insects (2).

Result of the Forest Service Method

% of misdiagnoses on sales in the Northwest between 1990-95: >80% (2).

Scientific Attitude

Be prepared to accept data which might indicate that previous conclusions need to be updated.

Forest Service Attitude

Revert continually to policy manuals that rely upon old conclusions.

When Contemplating Wildfire

Scientific Method

Recognizes that the variation in weather from year to year determines fire behavior more than the variation in fuel density (9).

Forest Service Method

Insists that fuel variation primarily determines fire behavior.

"Forest Health" and Salvage Index

Mudslides

Percent of major slides in logged/roaded watersheds:	77.3 (1)
Percent of major slides in undeveloped watersheds:	22.7 (1)
Percent of failures associated with logging roads:	66.3 (1)

Insects and Diseases

Percent (of 130,000 trees sampled across ID, MT, OR, WY, and WA) of standing trees that are "diseased" or "insect-infested":	less than 1 (2)
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------

Last time that levels of root disease were at today's level:	1972-1974 (2)
--------------------------------------------------------------	---------------

Number of "emergencies" the Forest Service declared then:	0 (2)
-----------------------------------------------------------	-------

Forest Health

Assessment of general forest health in 1994:	"significant improvement over the last 70 years" (7)
----------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------

Assertion of general forest health in "Salvage Rider" 1995:	Not mentioned
-------------------------------------------------------------	---------------

Dead Trees

# of species of birds, mammals, amphibians and reptiles, nation-wide who use dead trees for food, nesting, or shelter:	149, 73, 93 (and nearly all fish) (10)
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------

Jobs

Number of jobs that Congressman Taylor claimed the salvage rider would directly and indirectly create in the forest products industry:	approximately 22,900 (3)
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------

Change in employment in the forest products industry as of 2nd quarter of 1995 in Oregon, Washington, Idaho, Montana, and California:	No change (3)
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------

The Federal Debt

Dollars of federal taxes Congressman Taylor said his 22,900 added jobs would produce:	\$150,000,000 (3)
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------

Dollars added to the national debt between 1992-1994 to harvest 18 billion board feet of timber from 2.2 million acres of National Forest:	\$1 billion (3)
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------

Number of forests out of 118 that lost money:	103 (3)
-----------------------------------------------	---------

Nation-wide average loss per harvested acre:	\$450 (3)
----------------------------------------------	-----------

Number of National Forests in Montana and Idaho that lost money lost money between 1992 and 1994:	All (3)
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------

Tree Regeneration

% of regeneration efforts that have been certified as being "satisfactory" between 1977 and 1994: **less than 50 (3)**

Cost per acre for regeneration efforts between 1977 and 1994: **\$314 (planted), \$663 (certified) (3)**

Some Positive Effects of Root Disease

It creates microclimates, provides habitat, builds soil, provides a protective "mat" for watersheds, provides thermal protection for wildlife, removes unsuitable trees from stands, and returns biomass to the system (2)

Things the Forest Service Overlooked when it Declared an Emergency

- Root disease has declined in intensity in the last ten years (2)
- Root disease was rarely diagnosed in inventories prior to the 1980s (2)
- Root disease peaks periodically (2)
- Root disease has been far more destructive in the past than it is now (2)

Failures of the Past: Former Forest Service Strategies for Dealing with Insects and Disease

Ribes Eradication Program for Blister Rust Control (1950s-1960s) —Employed thousands of workers (2)

—Merited its own research station (2)

—Resulted in no effect to the disease (2)

Forest Service painted White Pine trees with antibiotics (1950s-1960s)

—Resulted in later outbreaks (2)

—Made many workers ill (2)

Forest Service cut buffers around outbreaks of oak wilt (1950s)

—Did nothing to stop the spread of disease (2)

—More trees were lost to the treatment than were to the disease (2)

Forest Service sprayed lindane on trees to control mountain pine beetles (1970s)

—The oil-based spray did more damage to the trees than the beetles (2)

Sources

1. Espinosa, Al. "Progress Report: Upper Lochsa Watershed and Flood Study." Moscow: Unpublished. 1995.
2. "Testimony of Dr. Arthur D. Partridge on Forest Health and the Salvage Sale Situation National Forests and Bureau of Land Management Lands before a Joint Oversight Hearing of the Subcommittees on National Parks, Forests and Lands and Resource Conservation, Research and Forestry of the Committees on Resources and Agriculture on behalf of Western Forest Campaign, National Audubon Society, and Inland Empire Public Lands Council." Washington: US Congress.
3. Forest Service. "Production, Prices, and Employment and Trade, 2d Quarter 1995."
4. Public Law 104-19. Section 2001(a)(3).
5. Public Law 104-19. Section 2001(b)(1).
6. Sampson, R. N., and D. L. Adams, Eds. *Assessing Forest Ecosystem Health in the Inland West*. Ithaca: Haworth.
7. USDA Forest Service. "America's Forests: 1994 Health Update." Washington DC: Agriculture Information Bulletin 696. 1993
8. Sampson, R. N., and D. L. Adams, Eds. *Assessing Forest Ecosystem Health in the Inland West*. Washington D.C.: The Forest Policy Center. 1991
9. Johnson, E. A., and C. P. S. Larsen. "Climatically Induced Change in fire frequency in the Southern Canadian Rockies." *Ecology* 72(1):194-201. 1990
10. Forest Service. U.S. GPO 1990-0-792-461. 1988
11. Christensen et al. "Interpreting the Yellowstone Fires of 1988." *Bioscience* 39:678-685.

THREATS TO THE NORTHERN ROCKIES

SOME EXAMPLES OF LAWLESS LOGGING

map key

1

Kootenai National Forest: Approximately 60% of all trees

slated to be cut under the salvage rider in Montana will come from the Kootenai National Forest. In fact, the Kootenai is scheduled to cut more trees than all the national forests in the Rocky Mountain, Southwestern, and Alaska regions combined. The Kootenai has consistently broken the memorandum of agreement signed by Jack Ward Thomas; many of the sales enter critical habitat for threatened or endangered species, impair water quality, log in roadless areas, and ignore specific Forest Plan standards and guidelines. Here are a few examples of the timber salvage sales underway.

•**NORTH FORK BIG CREEK and SOUTH FORK YAAK** These two sales total 57 million board feet and thousands of acres. The sales violate Forest Plan standards for road densities, clear cut size, and jeopardize critical wildlife habitat. The Kootenai National Forest fabricated grizzly bear habitat security models to justify these salvage sales and is blatantly disregarding its own management standards and guidelines.

TREGO TIMBER SALE In this proposal, the Fortine District identified 612 thousand board feet (mbf) as "salvage." An additional 4.906 million board feet (mmbf) would also be logged to "improve stand health."

Kootenai N.F. salvage timber sale decisions which violate Forest Plan Standards

Canyon Area Salvage Forest Plan Standards limiting opening size and open road densities exceeded.

Cripple Horse Fire Recovery Project Forest Plan Standards limiting opening size and open road densities were exceeded.

Brush Creek Area Salvage Forest Plan Standards limiting opening size and open road densities were exceeded.

Twin Meadows Salvage Forest Plan Standard limiting opening size was exceeded.

Webb Fire Salvage and Resource Rehabilitation Project Forest Plan Standards limiting opening size and open road densities were exceeded.

Barron Salvage Timber Sale Forest Plan Standards limiting opening size and open road densities were exceeded. Also, in violation of the National Environmental Policy Act, no public review and comment period was allowed.

Peace Alexander Salvage Project Forest Plan Standards limiting opening size and open road densities exceeded.

Little Wolf Fire Salvage Timber Sale Includes Project Specific Amendment to allow exceptions of 1.5 mi./sq. mi. and 2.3 mi./sq. mi. in MA 12, where existing ORD standard is 0.75 mi./sq. mi. Project also violates Forest Plan Standards limiting opening size, including one clearcut of 177 acres (no amendment deemed necessary).

Whirling Goats Salvage Timber Sale Allows ORD in BAA 4-9-2 (which includes checkerboard Plum Creek land) to remain at 1.73 mi./sq.mi. in violation of 0.75 mi./sq.mi. standard; logs in a burned area that already provides insufficient cover to meet the Forest Plan requirement of 600 ft. leave corridor adjacent to a previous clearcut not yet providing hiding cover; reduces core area in violation of July 27, 1995 USFWS incidental take statement.

China Basin Salvage Timber Sales The Decision waives the 0.75 mi./sq.mi. standard to allow roads to remain open in BAA 4-10-1 until IGBC adapts new standards "which should occur within the next year." Also, "Salvage activities will deviate from prescribed Visual Quality Objectives assigned to lands designated as MA 12 (no amendment deemed necessary). And, "Salvage activities will result in openings over 40 acres in size" (no amendment deemed necessary even though the EA states on page 94 that the chosen alternative "would require an exception to Forest Plan standards to exceed opening size"). They claim Forest Plan is not violated due to Regional

guidance allowing such cutting unit sizes in response to such "catastrophic" events. Finally, "The Forest Plan standard of 600 feet between 40 acre openings is also exceeded in many areas" (EA at 94).

2 Middle Fork Ecosystem Management Project - Flat-head National Forest

Located just outside of Glacier National Park this project is touted as a prototype for "ecosystem management", this project, was never identified as a salvage sale. This sale will impact roadless areas, old growth, key grizzly bear and bull trout habitat. The Middle Fork Record of Decision was withdrawn pending appeal prior to passage of the salvage rider 104-19. On October 26, 1995, under direct orders from Hal Salwasser, Regional Forester, the District Ranger re-evaluated the sale and determined that it met the requirements of 104-19. Forest Service silvicultural records for the area indicate there is **NO** emergency situation. This is not a dead, dying or burned forest this is a green, healthy forest.

3 Atlanta-Wagner Timber Sale - Helena National Forest

Enters three roadless areas and was not a salvage sale until after the salvage rider legislation was signed into law. This sale includes large clearcuts that violate the forest plan standards for wildlife habitat.

4 Fish Bate Timber Sale - Clearwater National Forest

This sale has been offered before but never as a salvage sale until passage of the salvage logging rider. The timber sale cuts old growth cedar and is located in an area that experienced mudslides and road failures due to past Forest Service mismanagement. Now the Forest Service wants to cut more trees and cause additional damage to soil, water, and wildlife habitat. The sale violates the 40 acres opening limitation on clear cut size. The sale will also wipe out entire populations of rare plant species.

5 Thunderbolt Timber Sale - Boise and Payette National Forests

The Thunderbolt timber sale lies within two designated roadless areas and the South Fork of the Salmon River, the most productive chinook spawning watershed in all of Idaho. The Forest Service initially predicted its selected alternative which logged 32 million board feet would sell for 2.8 million dollars. No bids were received, consequently, the volume was reduced to 13 million board feet and sold for 1 million dollars to the Boise Cascade Corporation. The timber contract requires Boise Cascade to log the 13 million board feet and it permits the Corporation to log the remainder of the original sale for a fixed rate of just twenty dollars per thousand board feet. Since 25 percent of timber receipts go to the counties, this scheme leaves the Forest Service with only about \$750,000 to spend on its fish habitat projects. The immense costs associated with this project will become the burden of the taxpayers who will pay twice; once for the costs of preparation and execution of the sale and again when some of the best remaining spawning habitat for chinook salmon is destroyed.

6 Main Salmon Post Fire Project - Payette Ntl Forest

This logging operation will destroy the integrity of the French Creek, Patrick Butte and Carey Creek roadless areas, degrade water quality and spawning habitat for chinook salmon.

SUBVERSION OF THE PUBLIC PROCESS

The Forest Service's Interpretation of the Salvage Rider:

Two recent letters from the Idaho National Panhandle Forest indicate the lack of respect for public input and the lip service being payed to the democratic process:

In violation of the National Environmental Policy Act, the District Ranger, Susan Jeheber-Matthews states that the Forest Service is not required to include environmental analysis of activities on private lands in their cumulative effects analysis:

"we have no jurisdiction or right to access those properties for the purpose of environmental analysis. The analysis of direct, indirect or cumulative effects includes effect of activities on National Forest System lands only."

She further states that, "Although response to public comment is not required under PL 104-19, I would like to address several of your statements." (emphasis added)

Forest Service Hides Behind Salvage Rider to Push Through Timber Sale The following excerpt is from Beaverhead National Forest Identification Team notes. The notes document an internal meeting in which the team is discussing how to ensure that the Tobacco Roots Vegetation Treatment project can qualify as a salvage sale so that administrative review is avoided: "This ties into the salvaging of the timber in the Tobacco Roots. And are we really trying to do something that is appealable?? ...The timing of this decision is important as to whether or not it will be appealable also...Wildlife Standards - current standards would allow burning of everything without a problem, yet harvesting could be a problem. Is it possible to do this project and waive amending the Forest Plan??" (emphasis added).

Payette National Forest to Convert Green Sales to Salvage Sales Ron Hamilton, Branch Chief of Wildlife, Soils, and Water for the Payette National Forest in Central Idaho told the McCall Star News that the Payette intends to convert green sales to salvage sales in order to avoid the appeals and litigation that have plagued the Payette NF in the past. "The fact they are not appealable doesn't hurt us," he told the Star News(2/22/96).

RESOURCES

Citizens from all over the country are concerned about the threats to their public lands. If you would like more information or have any questions check the following list of resources

Video

Green Fire productions, a non-profit organization recently produced *Logs, Lies, and Videotape*. Filmed in Idaho, Montana, Oregon, and Washington, this award winning video highlights examples of salvage sales and the ecological, economic, and social issues surrounding the salvage legislation. Contact Green Fire Productions at (503) 274-6234 phone/fax; grnfire@peak.org. \$6 for the first copy, \$3 for additional copies or \$2/copy for 10 or more.

Web Site of Environmental Groups of the Northern Rockies

on the world wide web at <http://www.wildrockies.org>

Organizations*

Alliance for the Wild Rockies
(406) 721-5420

Friends of the Wild Swan
(406) 886-2011

American Wildlands
(406) 586-8175

Idaho Sporting Congress
(208) 336-7222

Big Wild Advocates
(406) 821-3747

Inland Empire Public Lands Council
(509) 838-4912

Citizens Against Lawless Logging
(406) 542-0050

Native Forest Network
(406) 542-7343

Cove Mallard Coalition
(208) 882-9755

Northern Rockies Preservation Project
(208) 345-8077

Friends of the Bitterroot
(406) 363-0020

Road Rip
(406)543-9551

Swan View Coalition
(406)755-1379

The Ecology Center
(406) 728-5733

* This list is not complete -- there are many other groups and individuals working to protect the wildlands of the Northern Rockies

Political Decision-makers

• President Clinton: (202)456-1414/Fax (202)456-2883/public comment line (202) 456-1111; E-mail:president @whitehouse.gov

• Write to Senators and Representatives at:

Representatives	Senator_
U.S. House of Representatives	U.S. Senate
Washington, DC 20515	Washington, DC 20510

Agency Representatives

Jack Ward Thomas, Chief of Forest Service USDA Forest Service Box 96090 Washington, DC 20090	Bruce Babbitt, Secretary of Interior 1849 C Street, NW Washington, DC 20240 202-208-7351
Dan Glickman, Secretary of Agriculture 14th and Independent Streets, SW Washington, DC 20250 202-720-3631	Kathleen McGinty Council of Environmental Quality 202-456-2174
Hal Salwasser Regional Forester - MT and Northern ID Northern Region 200 East Broadway Missoula, MT 59807	Dale Bosworth Regional Forester - S. ID and Western WY Intermountain Region 324 25th Street Ogden UT 84401 (801) 625-5306

CURRENT LEGISLATION

THE GOOD...

In response to logging without laws repeal legislation (HR 2745) has been introduced by Representative Furse (D-OR).

- Write and call your Representative(s) and Senators and urge them to support HR 2745.
- Write and call President Clinton tell him to repeal the salvage rider.

...AND THE BAD

Senate Bill 391 (SB 391) sponsored by Idaho Senator Larry Craig is the newest threat to forest ecosystems. It is based on the "forest health" myth and advocates increased logging and road building as a way to improve the "health" of forests. The bill would:

- Allow the Forest Service to funnel money from other programs such as wild-life and fisheries to subsidize the logging program.
- Open Alaska's Kenai National Refuge up to logging. Absolutely no justification, need, or precedent exists for extending this authority to a National Wildlife Refuge.
- Gives the logging company "forest health credits" of healthy trees to be included in future sales.
- Undermines the Endangered Species Act by changing from mandatory to voluntary the requirement that the Forest Service and Bureau of Land Management consult with other agencies.
- Downgrades the need for environmental monitoring on certain sales.

IMAGES OF SALVAGE LOGGING AVAILABLE FOR MEDIA USE

Highlights include:

- **ground and aerial footage of salvage logging sites across the Northwest**
- **fire-scarred forest areas four years after a fire, showing regeneration**
- **logging activity and machines at work, including helicopter logging**
- **standing ancient forests slated to be logged & healthy ancient trees falling**
- **logging-related erosion: silt-filled rivers, landslides, and road blowouts**

Green Fire Productions (GFP) is a non-profit organization that produces educational video materials for the non-profit community. Since September 1995, GFP has been helping forest protection groups nationwide to raise public awareness of the abuses of our nation's so-called "salvage logging" program, which has come into the spotlight since the enactment last summer of a highly controversial federal "emergency salvage timber program," often referred to as the "salvage rider."

In addition to producing its own programs, **GFP provides high-quality video footage to the media for use in producing stories on salvage logging and related issues.** GFP's B-roll tape includes both ground and aerial footage of public forests and salvage logging operations in Oregon, Washington, Idaho, and Montana. This B-roll footage has been used by CNN's "Earth Matters," PBS's "News Hour with Jim Lehrer," and CBS's "60 Minutes," as well as numerous local tv news stations. GFP also takes special requests for other footage from its extensive archive on public lands.

GFP's video programs on salvage logging: GFP is producing a series of short, educational video programs on salvage logging that are being utilized by nearly 100 environmental groups and thousands of individuals in an effort to get the public involved in saving our forests. The first of these, "Logs, Lies, & Videotape," recently won three awards at the International Wildlife Film Festival. More than 4000 copies are now in circulation. GFP will be releasing a second program along with accompanying b-roll, focusing on the economic aspects of this issue, in June.

Footage included on B-Roll Tape

Tape is available in a variety of formats

Idaho

Boise National Forest: Boise River Fire Recovery Project

- erosion: silt-filled river, road blowouts, flooding
- helicopter salvage logging
- aerial overviews of salvage logging area

North Idaho: private land, Potlatch

- aerial views of landslides originating in clearcuts and adjacent logging roads as a result of Feb. '96 storms

Montana

Kootenai National Forest: Fourth of July Salvage Timber Sale

- machine logging of salvage timber
- overviews of salvage logged basin

Oregon

Umpqua & Siuslaw National Forests:

- standing ancient forest, slated to be cut

Malheur National Forest

- before-and-after shots of salvage logging site

Washington

Colville NF: Copper Butte Salvage Timber Sale

- green trees marked to be cut
- overview of salvage sale area

General

- fire-scarred forest: mosaic of burned and unburned areas
- natural regeneration of tree seedlings four years after a fire
- 300-year-old larch tree falling

GREEN FIRE PRODUCTIONS

P.O. BOX 11216 EUGENE, OREGON 97440 (541) 486-4070

Contact: Karen Meyer: 541-486-4070

SALVAGE LOGGING B-ROLL: FOOTAGE LOG

Time Code Description

Examples of National Forests Clearcut under the "Salvage Rider"

12:00 Umpqua National Forest, Oregon

12:08 Umpqua National Forest, Oregon

12:15 Siuslaw National Forest, Oregon: "Tobe West" salvage sale

12:30 Siuslaw National Forest, Oregon: "Tobe West" salvage sale

12:43 Colville National Forest, Washington: "Copper Butte" salvage sale

13:10 Okanogan National Forest, Washington: "Nicholson" salvage sale

13:23 Malheur National Forest, Oregon: "Jordan Springs" salvage sale

13:38 Malheur National Forest, Oregon: "Jordan Springs" salvage sale

Fire-Dependent Forest Ecosystems

13:58 Malheur National Forest, Oregon: "Jordan Springs" salvage sale

- Fire-scarred forest: mosaic of burned and unburned areas remaining after forest fire

14:13 • Trees scarred by fire but likely to survive-marked for salvage logging

14:27 Kootenai National Forest, Montana: Adjacent to "Fourth of July" salvage sale

- Natural regeneration of forest after a fire

14:49 • Natural regeneration of forest after a fire

Trees Marked for Clearcutting

15:07 Colville National Forest, Washington: "Copper Butte" salvage sale

- Healthy ancient forest-blue marks denote cut

15:20 • Close-up of above

15:32 • Healthy ancient forest-blue marks denote cut

Salvage Logging on National Forests

15:48 Kootenai National Forest, Montana

- 300-year-old larch tree falling-"forest health logging"

16:05 Malheur National Forest, Oregon: "Jordan Springs" salvage sale

- Tractor skidding in salvage unit

16:19 • Logged unit-compare with un-logged units shots @ TC 13:23 to

16:34 • Aerial, post-salvage logging

- 16:44 Kootenai National Forest, Montana: "Fourth of July" salvage sale unit
- Post-salvage logging-appears identical to a clearcut
- 16:59
- Post-salvage logging
- 17:11
- Clearcut units and salvage units are side-by-side and are in distinguishable from each other
- 17:27
- Salvage logging
- 17:44
- Salvage logging

- 18:26 Boise National Forest, Idaho: "Boise River" salvage sale
- Aerial of salvage logged area

Erosion, Road Blowouts, Floods & Landslides

- 18:56 Northern Idaho, Potlatch land
- Landslides originating in clearcuts & along logging roads (two shots)
- 19:41 Boise National Forest, Idaho: "Boise River" salvage sale
- Road closure sign due to flooding
- 19:49
- Stream and logging road blowout
- 20:05
- Stream blowout below logging road
- 20:16
- Sign-"road closed to public use"
- 20:29
- Sign-"logging contractor camping only"-partially under water
- 20:49 Siuslaw National Forest, Oregon
- Landslide originating from road above Buck Creek
- 21:04
- Silt-filled river resulting from Lobster Creek landslide

This report was compiled and prepared by the Alliance for the Wild Rockies

Special thanks to The Ecology Center, Bill Haskins, Jim Coefield, Bert Kraft, Jeff Juel, John Stanton, Bob Wolf, Green Fire Productions, Native Forest Network, and Art Partridge. Layout and design by Marlene Haas (thanks!), Jennifer Ferenstein, and Jim Coefield. Thanks to the many groups and individuals who made this information packet possible and for their continuing efforts to protect the native ecosystems and wildlands of the Northern Rockies.

Please see end of this report for a list of the many contributors.